

SURFSIDE BEACH TOWN COUNCIL FY 2016-2017 BUDGET WORKSHOP MINUTES APRIL 21 AND APRIL 22, 2016 - 9:00 A.M. TOWN COUNCIL CHAMBERS

THURSDAY, APRIL 21, 2016 – DAY 1

CALL TO ORDER.

Mayor Samples called the budget workshop to order at 9:00 a.m. on Thursday, April 21, 2016. Mayor Samples, Mayor-Elect Childs, Mayor Pro Tempore Pellegrino, and Councilmembers Johnson, Mabry (arrived at 9:45 a.m. and left at 11:11 a.m.), and Stevens were in attendance. One seat is vacant. A quorum was present. Others present: Councilmembers-Elect: Courtney and Ott. Staff: Administrator Fellner; Town Clerk Herrmann; Finance Director King; Planning Director Morris; Public Works Director Adair; Fire Chief Cimini; Police Chief Keziah, and Recreation Supervisor Ellis.

Ms. Fellner presented a PowerPoint presentation of the Budget Narrative that covered the first 25 pages of the budget workbook, a copy of which is on file. Multiple scenarios were covered along with discussion and questions answered during the session. Ms. Fellner said the upcoming fiscal year will be challenging and noted these points:

- Staff presented a balanced budget
- The budget was barebones to accommodate early beach renourishment
- Cash flow would be limited for the next nine months, if the grant for the fire department radios is awarded
- Cash flow would be limited for the next 18 months, if the grant for the fire department radios is not awarded
- · Revenues are flat and fixed overhead costs over which we have no control keep inching upward
- We have approximately \$3.6-million in the bank, which will leave us with approximately \$2.4-million after beach renourishment
- Beach renourishment was moved up a year
- The town must comply with the unfunded Federal mandate for public safety digital radios
- Fixed overhead costs continue to increase for workers compensation, retirement, utility services and healthcare benefits
- A majority of the factors attributable to the escalation are beyond the control of the town
- The tax millage in Surfside Beach is 46.2 mils. One mil equals approximately \$63,700
- Anticipated Revenue in the general fund -
 - Taxes on real estate, personal property and vehicles
 - > Business licenses, building permits, and franchise fees
 - > Transfer of revenue from other funds (pier, sanitation, Hospitality, accommodations taxes, capital projects)
- The town is essentially debt free, except for the fire truck lease with an outstanding balance of \$311,283 (includes interest) that is due June 30, 2020
- Services and property taxes Maintain current level of services for residents

47		55	
48	24-hour police protection	56 >	Town planning and zoning
49	24-hour fire protection	<i>57 ▶</i>	Local elections
50	Street cleaning and	58	Municipal court
51	maintenance	59	Free Spectator pier passes (residents)
52	Drainage maintenance		Half price fishing passes (residents)
53	Beach cleaning		Free parking (residents)
54	Parks and facilities cleaning	62 >	Parking decal sales to non-resident

- Maintain current staffing level

Organizational Committee recommendation to adjust police officers' salaries, total cost \$57,000

Cost of Living increase of 3-percent for staff

Ms. Fellner addressed the revenue sources and specific funds, explaining where funds were derived and how they were used.

• General Fund — the majority of the general fund revenue is derived from property taxes, business licenses, franchise fees, and permits. Expenditures from the general fund are for salaries and benefits; operating cost for all town departments; events; non-departmental, and debt service.

• Aid to Subdivisions — is administered by the State and is subject to State Legislature budgeting each year. Funds are derived from seven tax sources (banks, beer, wine, gasoline, motor transport, alcohol, and income taxes.) A percentage is returned to the town based on collections in the area and the population based on the latest census. The town expects \$84,000 in FY16-17.

 Parking Revenue – the town's parking function is managed through a contract with Lanier Parking Solutions. The proposed revenue for FY16-17 is \$313,800 in the general fund and \$169,000 in the pier fund.

• Land & Parking Reserve – excess funds received from meters and pay stations (except at the pier parking lot) are set aside for land purchases and parking equipment upgrades. Estimated reserves as of June 30, 2017 is \$320,670.

• Vehicle & Capital Item Replacement Reserve — each year three mils are transferred to this reserve fund to be used for vehicle and other capital item replacement. The anticipated balance on June 30, 2017 is \$618,728.

• Hospitality Funds – this is a one percent tax adopted May 28, 1996. The tax is levied on gross proceeds from sales of prepared meals and beverages sold in establishments and on short-term rental property. Total proposed for FY16-17, including fire radios is \$894,300. Hospitality funds can be used for taking care of the town's beach front, beach accesses, facilities associated with the beach (bathrooms, walkovers, etc.); transportation improvements, streets, stormwater drainage; sidewalks, bikeways, landscaping and other costs associated with rights-of-way, including engineering design; purchasing land and facilities for parks, sports facilities, and recreation buildings; property for public safety services, purchasing capital equipment for public safety; paying bond indebtedness used to fund any of these approved uses, and administrative cost associated with collections, accounting for and applying the Hospitality fee.

• Local Accommodations Fund — this is a 0.5-percent tax adopted July 1, 1997 that is levied on gross proceeds from rental or charges for accommodations furnished to transients (30 days rental or less.) Revenue must be kept in a separate fund and is used for tourism-related purposes. The total proposed for FY16-17 is \$165,100.

- State Accommodations Fund A 2-percent local accommodations tax (A-tax) on transient rental property (less than 90 days continuous rental). The first \$25,000 goes to general fund; remaining balance is split: 5-percent general fund; 30-percent to Myrtle Beach Area Chamber of Commerce, and 65-percent to the town's A-tax fund. Projected revenue for FY16-17 is \$600,300. The 65-percent projection for the A-tax fund is \$390,000. Major uses for A-tax funds are police services due to tourism industry, including BikeFest; raking the beach; upkeep of beach restrooms; cleaning the beach; beach renourishment, and special events cost that attract tourist from more than 100 miles away.
- Enterprise Funds are used to account for operations that are financed and operated in a manner similar to private industry. The intent is that the cost of providing goods or services to the general public will be recouped primarily through user charges. The town has two enterprise funds: the pier fund and the sanitation fund for which annual budgets are prepared.
 - ➤ Sanitation fund services provided for all residents include trash, recycle and yard debris pickup
 - Commercial dumpster service is provided to all town businesses
 - Charges for these serves are billed on the monthly Grand Strand Water & Sewer Authority (GSWSA) bills
 - ➤ Sanitation fund pays GSWSA \$1.25 per account for billing and collection services. This process has alleviated the need for the town to be involved in the associated processes and minimizes billing and collection questions and problems. GSWSA allows the town to utilize its records to help track new owners for sanitation service billing purposes and for local business license follow-up.
 - Net position anticipated as of June 30, 2017 is \$1,642,167. A minimum of 50-percent of the net position is earmarked for capital equipment.
 - FY16-17 revenues are estimated at \$1,389,600; expenditures at \$1,199,705.
 - > FY16-17 budget proposes that the sanitation fund transfer \$80,000 to the general fund to cover rent and salaries for support services paid by the general fund.
 - The town currently is not billed for its sanitation services, which would be consistent with standard accounting practices for an enterprise fund. A flat fee of \$50,000 would represent the approximate value of its services, which includes a volume discount.
 - Pier fund was established in 2008 when the pier was purchased by the town.
 - Fund collects spectator admissions and fishing licenses in addition to rent from the businesses located on the pier and parking fees in the pier lot.
 - > Residents are issued a free walking pass to the pier, which entitles them to a 50-percent discount on fishing license fees.
 - The net position for the pier fund includes \$2.1-million in real property value as it is calculated as an asset in an enterprise fund. Estimated net position on June 30, 2016 is \$2,826,320.
 - Pier fund owes the general fund \$244,500 as of April 1, 2017. Quarterly payments of \$40,750 are made to the general fund from all revenue sources, except A-tax revenue. The next payment is due July 1, 2016; the fund currently has sufficient monies to pay. The last payment should be made on October 1, 2018.
 - ➤ Discussions were held regarding additional attractions to the pier so it would become self-sustaining and self-insuring moving forward. The pier is only insured for liability, because the cost for full coverage is prohibitive. Expanding the pier's businesses would allow it to be self-insured.
 - ➤ A pier expansion initiative for the existing pier restaurant area is still awaiting clearance of some title search issues.
 - ➤ DDC Engineers was commissioned to write an amendment to our existing South Carolina Department of Health and Environmental Services Department of Ocean and Coastal Resource Management (OCRM) permit that is required to move forward with any project that expands the pier footprint. The permit is currently being reviewed by OCRM.

- Escalating pier expenditures include anticipated engineering costs associated with a possible expansion of \$45,000; beach renourishment contribution of \$30,000; increase pier contribution for Lanier expenses by 5-percent for a total of 35-percent, \$17,000, and new event costs \$7,000.
- Fund Balances each fund balance history was reviewed, copies of which are on file. Fund balances show the relative strength of the spending constraints placed upon each fund when it is used for the intended purposes. Fund balances are comprised of four components:
 - ➤ Non-spendable: inventory (e.g., diesel fuel)
 - Restricted: usually mandated by law (A-tax and Hospitality)
 - > Assigned: set aside by Town Council for a specific purpose
 - Unassigned: may be used for any purpose and are almost always found in the general fund
- Beach Renourishment Funding: The proposed balance on June 30, 2017 is zero (-0-), because beach renourishment will begin ahead of schedule. Ms. Fellner reiterated the proposal made at the visioning workshop to place \$100,000 from A-tax funds and \$100,000 from Hospitality funds each year to place in the Capital Projects Fund for beach renourishment.

Ms. Fellner's Closing Remarks and Conclusions:

- The initiatives used in developing the FY16-17 budget were aimed at
 - Developing a balanced budget
 - o Improving efficiency and effectiveness by optimizing utilization of employees
 - Researching and evaluating alternate funding sources including grants, fees, and expansion of businesses in the commercial district
 - o Minimizing negative impact to the general fund reserve balance
 - o Many items were deferred this year using input from the last two visioning meetings. Many of those items will return in the ensuing year's budget.
 - Compliance with the town's fund balance ordinance that includes a goal of 4 months reserve of general fund expenditures
 - Maintaining levels of service
 - o If costs beyond the town's control continue to rise, revenues plateau or decline, or an emergency situation arises, the balance could be significantly skewed
 - Good news the town is one of the few municipalities in the country that is not significantly encumbered with debt service
- Sustainable or Not?
 - O Some hard choices are not far away. When revenue is flat, but salaries, benefits, utilities, insurance and infrastructure costs escalate, it is not sustainable. What is the solution?
 - o Taking on debt (bonds) is one possible solution, but not a long term strategy
 - Continual tax increases, which is not desirable because at some point property ownership becomes undesirable and eventually unaffordable
 - Annexation; choosing not to grow when the tax base is so limited may ultimately be a choice to unincorporated
 - Slow dismantling of town departments and reductions in services is not a solution, unless un-incorporation is the goal
 - The smart solution is to begin with the end in mind. If the town wants to remain incorporated and able to sustain all of its services at the current level then revenue must keep pace with expenditures

Ms. Fellner thanked staff for their diligent work throughout the budget process. She thanked Director King and her staff particularly for their tireless work to meet her innumerable requests for data and statistical information. Town Council and the town citizens were also thanked for their support during the past year and she hoped everyone could continue to work together to successfully manage growth and services within the Family Beach.

219 220 221

222 223 Comments & Questions.

230

231

232

233

234

235

236

237

238

239

240

241

242

243

244

245 246

247

248

249

250

251

252

253

254

255 256

257 258

259

260

261

262 263

264

265

266

267

268 269

270

275

Mayor Samples said it was important for council to set priorities and to plan for known expenditures like beach renourishment. This fiscal year the town purchased the historical property; the county issued the radio mandate; beach renourishment was moved up and the town had to pay now. The town is done with catching up, and now plans need to be implemented for future expenses. No one wants to hear tax increases. It is important to maintain priorities and to make decisions to defer expenditures when necessary. It is up to Town Council to maintain the citizens' quality of life and safety.

Ms. Mabry apologized for being late and said the reason she came was to implore Town Council to do something to increase the police officers' salaries. The town is going to end up not having a police department, if something was not done. By the time taxes and retirement are taken out of gross, the officers are receiving \$6.73 per hour [sic.] We spend \$40,000 training every police officer and then they leave to go to another agency or private business where they can make a living to feed their family. Officers are working second full time jobs; you cannot do that and give your best to your first time job. She begged council to put in numbers that were sustainable for the police department. If you can find a way to put \$1.2 million in beach renourishment in four years, you can find way to do all the improvements we've done, you can find a way to have a sustainable police department that isn't costing us so much money in training and in overtime. She said \$63,000 in overtime, because we don't have a policeman; they're coming and going like revolving doors. Get on board, do the right thing. If you don't do anything else, do the right thing for these for these policemen. You might always want to consider the fire department, too, because [the Chief] is staring me down (laughter.) People move to town, because it is clean and safe. It's a community in which they feel comfortable. Take that away, and it won't matter how many plants are planted or roads paved, if the community does not feel like it's safe, you will lose the businesses and residents. That's a fact.

Mr. Pellegrino said the numbers show the town is spending more than it is receiving, which is bad. A true balanced budget is when the revenues and expenditures are equal. He thanked staff, because he thinks they did a good job on the budget. Beach renourishment is \$1.2 million, and the radios were expenses that were not anticipated. In 2015, \$400,000 funds were put in the disaster fund; nothing has been done since. We need to focus on that. He explained that the first thing he did when he received the finance reports was to look the balances for beach renourishment, unassigned funds, and disaster funds. If those balances are increasing, we are in good shape. The town does have an advantage, because we don't have any debt. We were in crisis mode this year because of beach renourishment. Next year we need to build up unassigned and disaster funds, and to make sure funds are saved for beach renourishment.

Lunch Recess at 11:11 a.m. Reconvene at 1:01 p.m.

Ms. Fellner said the organizational committee had reviewed the salaries for the police officers, light equipment operators, and laborers. The narrative included \$57,000 in this budget (see line 66) for adjustments to salaries for these employees. Certified and uncertified police are increasing from \$30,151 base to \$33,000 uncertified base and \$35,370 certified base.

Mayor Samples said Ms. Mabry mentioned earlier that take home pay was \$6 and change per hour. The rate is \$17 per hour based on 2,080 hours annually. Ms. King said police is based on 2,223 hours annually and fire is based on 2,756 hours annually, because their schedules are different. The hourly rates are between \$14 and \$15 per hour; overtime occurs after the employee works a certain number of hours.

Mr. Courtney asked if there was night shift differentials. Chief Keziah said no.

271 272 273 274

Mr. Pellegrino asked what percentage was taken out of gross pay. Ms. King said probably 35percent. Mr. Pellegrino said the employees were basically \$10 an hour now. Ms. King said the pay was not great. She reminded council that the retirement board requires the town to pay 13.5-percent to match the employees' pay 11-percent contribution based on gross pay. This was true for most government employees.

299

300 301

289

312

320

329 330

Ms. Fellner thought Ms. Mabry was talking about some of the laborers and light equipment operators when the mentioned the \$6 per hour rate. Mayor Samples said the amount was used in context with the police officers. Ms. Fellner said it was not the police officers. She recognized the \$6 and change amount, and it was from a grounds position. Mr. Adair said laborers started at \$21,000; light equipment operators started at \$25,000. Once deductions were taken out, that resulted in the \$7 per hour figure.

Mr. Pellegrino said in spite of the take home pay, the employees were receiving benefits. A waiter could make more than \$10 per hour, but he would not get any benefits. Mr. Adair said the titles in his department were identified, because they were compared with other towns. Those two positions were glaringly out of line. Other positions pay in the department were comparable.

Ms. Fellner said the salary information was vetted through the organizational committee. All the salaries and supporting documentation was presented. Some of the comparison data included that the City of Myrtle Beach pays 100-percent of the employee's insurance; but, the employee is responsible for 100-percent of any insurance cost for a spouse, child, or family. Mayor Samples said the town pays a significant portion for families. Ms. Fellner said that was a big benefit.

Mayor Samples said the organizational committee unanimously recorded approval of the proposal.

Mr. Stevens asked what the total dollar value was when insurance was included for an employee. Ms. Fellner said 20- to 21-percent. Ms. King said the total cost of the town is \$48,131 for a base pay police officer making \$31,151. She explained that included unemployment, medical, and everything.

Chief Keziah said everyone, including the officers, understands that the town takes care of its employees. The problem is you have 20 - 22 year old kids that are not looking long range. They can work for the town a year and then go to another department for \$10,000 more a year to start. For three years of experience with any law enforcement agency, the South Carolina Highway Patrol is starting officers at \$43,000 with state benefits and a take home patrol car that can be used for personal business. Myrtle Beach will start officers as high as \$47,000 if they have experience. The officer leaving the town now has three years with the town. He lives in Little River, and is going to work for Horry County. He will get a \$4,000 pay raise and a take home patrol car. He believes this assessment will fill the gap between supervisors and officers. Saying that, salaries had to be adjusted so the officers would not match the supervisor salaries.

Mr. Courtney asked how much officers started at in North Myrtle Beach. Chief Keziah said North Myrtle Beach is public safety. They start uncertified at \$41,000 and change. They have separate police and fire departments, but all officers are cross trained and keep up with mandated training.

Mr. Stevens asked what the rate was for grounds employees. Ms. King said a grounds employee starting at \$21,500 would cost the town \$32,130. The medical amount would change depending on whether the employee chose single, spouse, child, or family.

Mr. Ott asked if the majority of officers hired had any training. Chief Keziah said trained officers are hired, if they can be attracted. There have not been any trained officers hired recently. There are usually three levels:

- Uncertified, which requires 12 weeks at the South Carolina Police Academy for full training
- Certified between 1 year and 3 years, that is they were in police work, but have been out more than one year, but not more than 3 years, or the certification is from a different state, which requires 6 weeks at the Academy
- Currently certified or certified within the last year, in house training on legal updates and town methods is done and they officer can go to work immediately

Mr. Ott said training cost was almost much as what they would earn elsewhere. He said officers were paid while at academy. Chief Keziah said if an officer was hired today with no certification, it would be at least six or seven months before he was on the road.

Mr. Courtney asked if the police department used classified officers. Chief Keziah said the department uses Class 1 officers; detention and dispatch officers were Class 2. Mr. Courtney asked if uncertified individuals were hired. Chief Keziah said he preferred to hire certified officers. Lately, that had not been successful. Candidates choose other agencies that pay better, but sometimes the changes were based on logistics. An officer recently transferred to Georgetown, because he lives in Litchfield and his wife works in Georgetown. Mr. Courtney said there was very limited opportunity for promotion.

Mr. Johnson said on an optimistic note, the town has some good officers that have served the town for quite a while. Chief Keziah thought the officers that had long tenure understand that the town takes care of its employees. Christmas bonuses and longevity pay are good benefits. Some officers have 15-years and some working on 20-years. The attitude towards police officers has an impact, especially when young officers are starting their families. If a change in department or job will increase his pay significantly, they have a lot of pressure to take care of his family.

Mayor Samples knew that the town cannot get out of the South Carolina Retirement System, but he asked if there was some way to establish a 401K savings for Millennials and match up to a certain amount, that would increase the take home pay and have a portable retirement that could transfer with them. It was unusual for someone to stay in the same department. Chief Keziah did not know the answer. The Pawleys Island police department did not participate in the retirement plan. Ms. Fellner said they would have to look into this very carefully. Mayor Samples thought this would provide another option for younger employees. A former chief tried to maintain a balance on staff by hiring retired officers and young officers.

Ms. Fellner reiterated that the \$57,030 is already included in the budget to adjust salaries for the police officers, light equipment operators, and grounds laborers.

Mr. Johnson asked why \$7,500 was proposed for the oak trees. Mr. Adair said the arborist assessed the historical trees. The preliminary finds were that the trees are between 220 and 275 years old. They will require pruning, and injections to control pests and bugs, and fertilizer.

Mr. Pellegrino said that expenditure was the one thing in the budget that he totally disagreed with. God has taken care of that tree for 275 years. In his opinion, the tree will die quicker when chemicals are put on it.

Mr. Adair said the trees were declining. Critters and varmints were stressing the trees. Best practices in the industry dictate this action. It was council's decision whether to treat the trees.

Neither Mr. Courtney nor Mr. Ott had never heard of this type treatment. Mr. Adair would share the literature.

Mr. Ott asked if the town knew this expense would be incurred when the property was bought. Mayor Samples said absolutely.

Ms. Fellner said if there were no other questions or comments, the council should comment on the budget preparation and presentation.

Mayor Samples: I think we're in good shape. We're doing what we need to do. It's definitely lean. It needs to be lean, and it was very well done.

Mr. Childs: I agree with Mayor Samples, and I think you did a great job. I think staff did a great job. I read it last night, and I think anything you want to know about the town expenditures is there. It's about as lean as you can possible be.

Mr. Pellegrino: I'm very concerned with the \$800,000 higher expenditures than revenue. But, I understand that beach renourishment is the major reason for that. So, that means we will be challenged, the challenge next year will be much more difficult as we work to build up reserves. Good job, staff. When we first found out that we were gonna have to pay beach renourishment, we thought it was gonna be September. Then it was early summer. I honestly thought the overage would be a lot higher. So, good job managing those numbers. Ms. King said pray for a good summer...no, April and May is when we need the money.

Ms. Fellner said business licensing was doing well so far. Mayor Samples said that was an important point for the new members. There are two times a year that the town gets "real money." Property tax time and business license time. The rest of the year is "nickel and dime chump change."

Mr. Stevens: I'll tell you what I'd like to see. How do we get our expenses and revenue the same? It seems like we've been transferring money every year. How do we get our expenses and revenue to balance without transferring money, because we've been transferring money since 2007? Ms. Fellner referred Mr. Stevens to the closing remarks.

Mayor Samples: We're a beach community. We're always gonna be doing that. That is why we police it at the level we do. If we did have the summers that we have...

Mr. Stevens: We did now in 2013.

Ms. Fellner said to remember there were many fixed costs beyond the town's control that little to nothing could be done to change that. Staff always tries to be as lean as possible. This year there were pretty serious expenses with beach renourishment and the radio mandate. She understood Mr. Stevens's comments from a business perspective, and it would be great to have a balanced budget, but the budget will always need infusions of capital from the Hospitality and A-tax funds to operate the town, and that is why those taxes were adopted and are collected.

Mr. Johnson: Will, I certainly appreciate all the hard work that everyone has done. This is, like everybody said, it's a very lean budget, and I like the way it is. As far as that (**) goes, I would like to see it virtually the same next year, because I understand that we are going to have to have some purchases made that only towns have to purchase. But, I'm good with it. Thank you very much.

Mr. Ott: Well, it's the first one I've really got to look at. I've gotta new way to look at the word balanced. And, a new way to look at the word lean in my vocabulary. I can see the work that has gone into it. It's magic. I'll leave it at that. I'll continue on a learning phase.

Mr. Courtney: I think a lot of work went into it. It is very lean. But, I think there is room for improvement in the future. I think it's imperative that we bring in the employees' wages up a little bit, if possible, in the future. It's the only way we're gonna keep employees here and we're not losing them. It's costing us in the long run when we lose an employee after we train them for ten years. From the very little I know and from what I read, you guys did a lot of good work on it. But, what we have coming in is the best we can do right now.

Mayor Samples thanked everyone for attending and recessed the meeting until 9:00 a.m. tomorrow, Friday April 22^{nd} .

FRIDAY, APRIL 22, 2016 - DAY 2

Mayor Samples reconvened the workshop at 9:00 a.m. on Friday, April 22, 2016. Mayor Samples, Mayor-Elect Childs, Mayor Pro Tempore Pellegrino, and Councilmembers Stevens were in attendance. Councilmembers Johnson and Mabry were absent. One seat is vacant. A quorum was present. Others present: Councilmembers-Elect: Courtney and Ott. Staff: Administrator Fellner; Town Clerk Herrmann; Finance Director King, and Public Works Director Adair.

451

456 457 458

Ms. Fellner presented the town's stormwater needs explaining that a dedicated funding source was necessary to improve and maintain the town's system. The information was presented with a goal of determining whether town council would consider implementing a stormwater utility fee. To determine the proper ERU (equivalent residential unit), the town's stormwater consultant would be hired at a cost of \$7,500. If an ERU was adopted, then the town could save money for these projects, and in the event of a catastrophe, a loan could be taken out because an ERU was adopted. The priorities could change, based on Town Council's input. She cited:

- Maintaining and improving our infrastructure will be critical in the coming years
- The town needs to address the next phases of the north side drainage project, which has already been modeled
- Weaknesses in the north side area were proven during the recent rain events
- The town's aging bulkheads and outfalls need to be redesigned and replaced to properly safeguard the future

Priority	Identified Stormwater Projects	Estimated Cost
1	Phase II North Side Drainage Project	\$700,000
2	Myrtle Swash – new bulkheads	\$357,000
3	Floral Swash – new bulkheads	\$279,000
4	Dogwood Swash – replace Ocean Boulevard Culvert Bridge	\$170,000
5	Myrtle Swash – replace Ocean Boulevard Culvert Bridge	\$200,000
6	Melody Basin – Eliminate Discharge into Garden City	\$1,000,000
	Total	\$2,706,000

459 460

Ms. Fellner disagreed with the priority order saying she believed that number 6, the Melody Basin project should be done first, because this is a huge liability; a 90:10 share for stormwater projects in Garden City downstream from Melody Basin.

462 463 464

465

466

467 468

469

461

Mr. Adair said the stormwater improvements started on the south end of town, because homes were being flooded. Now, the north side of town was being more densely developed and problems are being seen. The Magnolia basin and upper Myrtle basin were modeled against 25-year, 50-year, and 100year storms to see how the system would perform. The weak areas were determined based on the model. The municipal standard is that systems should be designed to handle at least a 25-year rain fall event without any type of flooding. The top priority jobs were done last year: 3rd Avenue North from Poplar down to Myrtle, 16th Avenue North, and a small part of Cedar Drive.

#1 - The next phase, Phase II, would be 11th Avenue North, a small part of Cherry Drive, 14th Avenue North from around Cedar to Dogwood, and probably 2nd Avenue North from Poplar down to Myrtle.

#2 – Myrtle Swash, from Ocean Boulevard out to the beach. Those are aging wooden bulkheads built around the late 1980s.

479 480 481

478

Mr. Stevens said his company bid on replacing the Myrtle Swash bulkheads at a price of about \$100,000, which was much lower than the estimates given by the engineer in the budget. He reiterated his believe that the prices in the budget were inflated.

483 484 485

482

Mr. Adair confirmed that the estimates were done by the engineer, who historically inflated amounts between 10- to 20-percent. The theory is to allow for unknown circumstances and/or errors: over estimating was preferable to underestimating. When the bids were submitted, pricing could be evaluated based on the same criteria. He continued with the priority list.

486 487 488

489

490

491

Mr. Stevens asked Mr. Adair to provide the documentation that the town owns this swash, because he believed it was privately owned. Mr. Adair said he would do so, as the town attorney researched the title and determined the swash is owned by the town. He noted that he would never spend the town's money unless he was sure it was on the town's property.

492 493

494 495

496 497

502

510 511 512

513

514

508

509

543

- #3 Floral Swash, from Ocean Boulevard out to the beach. Same condition as #2; aging wood bulkheads that are in bad shape. Floral swash goes out to the ocean at 3rd Avenue South.
- #4 Dogwood Swash, replace the Ocean Boulevard culvert bridge, which is a wooden pile structure. Concrete box culverts should be installed.
- #5 Myrtle Swash, replace the Ocean Boulevard culvert bridge, which is a wooden pile structure. Concrete box culverts should be installed.
- Mr. Pellegrino said the state owned Ocean Boulevard up until many years ago, and the town made a "stupid deal" with them and took over Ocean Boulevard. Now, when there is a hurricane, the town has to pay to rebuild it.

Mayor Samples said Town Council never voted to accept Ocean Boulevard.

- Mr. Stevens asked if that would be like work done on Scipio Lane in the county. Mr. Stevens said the outfall at Floral at 3rd Avenue South is a concrete double box culvert, which is what Myrtle and Dogwood swashes should have.
- #6 Melody Basin discharge into Garden City. The county agreed to pay for 70 percent of any major improvements in the Dogwood basin, because it is mainly county water passing through that basin. The town pays 30-percent per that agreement. When there are severe rain events, the Melody Basin discharges a small amount of water from 20 acres in town into Garden City through the Woodland weir, and out to the marsh. The area is equivalent 16th to Melody from Highway 17 to Dogwood. Mayor Samples said it was emergency overflow. Mr. Pellegrino asked if any discharge went through during the big rain event last fall. Mr. Adair said he inspected the drainage and there was nothing passing through. At Rose Real Estate on Melody Lane, the water was coming into town. Because of the 70:30 agreement, the county required the town to sign an agreement that it would be responsible inversely for 90-percent of the improvements below that channel running into the marsh.

Mayor Samples had no recollection of Town Council ever voting on that contract. Ms. Fellner said the county recently did repairs downstream of this channel and asked the town to pay its portion of \$8,000. She mitigated the request by disputing the amount of water running from the town. The county's models show much more water passing from the town than actually is discharged. Mr. Adair said the county map shows water from the BI-LO pond, but that water actually travels towards 13th Avenue South. Ms. Fellner did not know if the cost would be \$1-million, but she did believe this was a major liability for the town. Mr. Adair said if the area was redirected to 13th Avenue South and new pipes were installed, it would be about \$1-million. Mayor Samples asked if the 13th Avenue South was where 14th and 15th Avenues channel drained. Mr. Adair said yes. The town has a NPDES (National Pollutant Discharge Elimination System) permit to discharge water into the ocean. It is required to maintain best management practices to ensure the water is clean. If there is a recurring problem over years, DHEC (South Carolina Department of Health and Environment Control) will establish a TDML or total daily maximum load, on the impaired water body. In Murrells Inlet, they were repaired for shellfish after a pollutant of concern was identified. It will cost the town money if a TDML is imposed by DHEC. The discharge going through to the marsh already has a TDML assigned. The town has not been cited as a contributor by DHEC, yet. There have been three audits over the past five years. The stormwater maps were reviewed by DHEC and Horry County, and the town has been left out of it. DHEC determined that Horry and Georgetown counties were responsible. Because the town is at the top of that drainage system, DHEC could say the town is partially responsible.

A discussion ensued regarding animal polluting the waters. Mr. Adair said this was something that councilmembers should be aware of because it could create a liability for the town. The town's stormwater needs will never end, because pipes fail, upgrades are required, catch basins will need to be made bigger as development occurs, etc. If there is no funding source, the projects will not be done.

Ms. Carol Lucas asked how the road way and the contract for the Melody Basin were approved, if the councilmembers did not vote. Mayor Samples said poor administration. Mr. Pellegrino said no one voted on the matters. The previous administrator did it on his own. Ms. Fellner added that any action requiring over \$10,000 was required to have Town Council approval. (**several speaking at once.)

Ms. Fellner said Surfside Beach is one of the few remaining MS4s in the state that has not adopted some type of stormwater utility program as a stand-alone. Options commonly used to derive a stormwater fee are:

- A dedicated percentage of property taxes (millage)
- A flat fee for residential; possibly a different fee for commercial (land use)
- A calculated fee based on percentage of impervious surface
- A fee tied in to some other factors

What our neighbors are doing:

Entity	Stormwater Utility Fee	How Collected	Base ERU Fee – Single Family
City of Myrtle Beach	Yes, adopted 1990s	Monthly Water Bill	\$69.00 annually
City of North Myrtle Beach	Yes, adopted 2000	Monthly Water Bill	\$72.00 annually
Town of Mount Pleasant	Yes	Annual Property Tax Bill	\$60.00 annually
Horry County	Yes, adopted 2000	Annual Property Tax Bill	\$29.40 annually
Georgetown County	Yes, adopted 2007	Annual Property Tax Bill	\$52.00 annually

Mr. Adair said most communities do not base the stormwater utility on a percentage of millage, because that amount would vary and be subject to use for other purposes. Most places have a stormwater utility fee based on an ERU. A discussion ensued regarding the project scope, cost, time frame, taxable properties, land use studies, etc. Mr. Adair explained that the stormwater consultant would consider all that data based on Town Council's priority list to determine the ERU. Mr. Adair expected the study to cost about \$7,500. Town Council would have the option to adjust the ERU as it does the millage during the budgeting process, depending on the upcoming projects.

Ms. Fellner reiterated that she did not want to spend the money for the stormwater consultant unless Town Council was willing to consider adopting a stormwater utility fee. She explained that having the consultant evaluate the town's needs and infrastructure would limit the town's liability. Mr. Adair said stormwater utility fees were challenged in court all across the country. Generally, they are found to be legal as long as the fees are charged equitably. The consultant has worked on utility fees for at least five different municipalities. Ms. Fellner said he also did a great job on the town's stormwater permits. Mr. Pellegrino asked if the \$7,500 for tree maintenance could be used. Mr. Courtney said he was going to suggest the money for the tree shots. (Laughter.) Mr. Adair said there are needs coming up, and the town must have a way to fund them.

Mr. Stevens asked if a stormwater utility fee was adopted, if the tax millage would be reduced by 2 mils. Ms. Fellner said the 2 mils would be put into the general fund to fund operating cost. Mr. Stevens said this would be another charge on top.

Mayor Samples said he would like to 'draw a line in the \$1-million, too.' [Referring to #6 Melody Basin.] Having said that, if there is a future liability because of the TDML, you do not want the Federal government opening shop down here watching what we do. The town will pay a lot more for it. Mr. Adair said the town might be assigned its own TDML in the future.

Ms. Fellner said that was all she had to present; the projects and the expected costs. It was council's decision whether to do these projects. The first step towards completing the projects is to define a funding source. She did not want the town to be sued, because we are not willing to pay \$7,500 for a

Page 11 of 13

study by a stormwater consultant who really knows what he is doing. On the other hand, she did not want to pay that money unless Town Council would consider a stormwater utility fee.

Mr. Courtney did not believe there was a choice in the matter. Mr. Adair said the merits of each project could be debated, and the priorities could be changed. The bottom line is that all of the projects have to be done over the next 10 years or so. Mr. Courtney said it would probably cost more if the projects were deferred, and asked which projects had to be done now. Mr. Adair said at least two or three of them should be done in the next five years; cost would be between \$500- and \$700-thousand. The goal is to make the town resilient; the stormwater system enhances all the other programs like the building codes, FEMA rating, and CRS program.

Mr. Pellegrino said there may not be a choice about completing the projects, but there was a choice as to how it would be funded. Mr. Adair said the town could borrow money; establish a flat fee across the board, or establish an ERU. It was entirely up to Town Council.

Mayor Samples asked which project would be most catastrophic. Mr. Adair said in his opinion, the most catastrophic event would be an Ocean Boulevard culvert failure, which would not only cut off discharge, but also close a road. Mayor Samples suggested that council prioritize based on impact, if there was a failure.

Mr. Childs agreed with Mayor Samples; Ocean Boulevard was the most important.

Mr. Stevens extrapolated the total cost for all six projects saying that over a 10-year period, the cost would be \$58.86 per property. Mr. Adair said projects would continually be added to the list; these six were the one identified that need to be done over the next five to 10 years.

Mr. Pellegrino asked what the balance is in the stormwater account. Ms. King said at the end of this year the balance is projected at \$168,000; projections for next year's revenue and expenditures were flat. There is generally about \$100 difference from year-to-year. Ms. King explained that the extra two mils were needed in the general fund for operations. She said nobody wants a tax increase, but every year the two mils are taken out of general fund, it weakens the fund. Mr. Pellegrino said that was a tax increase. Ms. King said yes, it was. It cost the average homeowner \$600 to live here.

Ms. Fellner added that if millage for stormwater is continually designated out of the general fund, then the general fund will be drained of all excess and the general fund will be unhealthy.

Mayor Samples said if there one mild storm during the season, the businesses will shut down for at least a week or two, because no tourists will come, which will significantly impact revenue from A-tax and Hospitality taxes. If Town Council chose to adopt a stormwater fee, it would allow the town to issue bonds for a project. Ms. King said that was correct. Mayor Samples said the fact is, when the tax increase is adopted, it will not be fairly distributed as to those paying and not paying. He personally loves his low tax bill. State law requires the town to hit the business harder; the businesses do not get a tax break, or a refund of the school money that residents get. He argued that a more fair method would be not hitting the mom and pop restaurants with multiple ERUs. Ms. Fellner said Mayor Samples was basically talking about a flat fee. When the consultant does the calculations, you can tell him exactly what you want. We do not want the businesses hit; we want everybody to bear the same burden. A discussion ensued about charges to second home owners, residents' perks, fixed incomes, etc. and how ERUs would or could be charged and collected.

Mr. Childs said the town was fortunate during the rain event last October. If another storm damaged the town, the fee would be nothing compared to a resident losing everything. Many people were not insured. Mr. Childs supported the study.

Mr. Courtney said the ERU would be a small price to pay. Hurricane Irene put 4-feet of water in his house, and Hurricane Sandy put 6-feet of seawater in his house [in New York.] Mr. Pellegrino said nothing the town could do would prevent storm surge. Mr. Courtney said having nowhere for the water to drain created problems. Mr. Adair said most of these projects were maintenance. During the October

rain event, King Tides with 7-foot plus high tides occurred at the same time. Getting the water out of town was the biggest challenge. Staff was on the beach in the early morning hours during low tides digging out the swashes so water would discharge. Ms. Fellner said the culverts were filled to the top; it was scary. Mayor Samples said he had never seen that much water in the culverts. Mr. Adair said a storm surge on top of a high tide would put Ocean Boulevard under water. (**several people speaking at once.)

Mr. Pellegrino asked if Ms. Fellner needed consensus to move forward with the stormwater consultant study. Ms. Fellner said again that she did not want to spend money, if the council was going to dismiss the proposal. She asked if council would allow her to bring a proposal back for consideration of implementing a stormwater utility fee during this fiscal year. The price would be negotiated, if possible.

Mr. Pellegrino, Mr. Childs, Mr. Courtney, Mr. Stevens, and Mr. Ott supported the study. Town Council **CONCURRED** to move forward with the stormwater consultant study this fiscal year and to consider a stormwater utility fee ordinance.

Ms. Wanda Spannuth said as a resident she did not mind the study or the implementation of a stormwater utility fee. She was impressed during the big rain that the town did not flood, while neighboring areas flood.

Ms. Carol Lucas thought it would be beneficial to have articles in the town newsletter about the stormwater system, the proposed fee, and definitions for terminology, i.e. pervious versus impervious. She said that councilmembers should be more vocal about the work they do.

Mr. Childs agreed that articles in the newsletter would be beneficial. Mr. Adair said signage is placed throughout town to help maintain stormwater quality, i.e. don't feed the animals.

ADJOURNMENT.

Mayor Samples adjourn the meeting at 10:15 a.m.

	Prepared and submitted by,	
Approved: May 10, 2016	Debra E. Herrmann, CMC, Town Clerk	
Dougla	s F. Samples, Mayor	
David L. Pellegrino, Mayor Pro Tempore	Robert F. Childs, Town Council	
Mark L. Johnson, Town Council	Mary Beth Mabry, Town Council	
Randle M. Stevens, Town Council	Vacant Seat	

Clerk's Note: This document constitutes summary minutes of the meeting that was digitally recorded. Appointments to hear recordings may be scheduled with the town clerk. Bring a flash drive to obtain a copy. In accordance with FOIA, meeting notice and the agenda were distributed to local media and interested parties. The meeting notice was posted on the town website, the entry door at Town Council Chambers, and on the Town marquee.